## Q8. Is reducing the availability of alcohol effective in reducing deaths from suicide, suicide attempts and acts of self-harm?

#### **Background**

Numerous studies have analyzed the relationship between alcohol consumption and suicide on individual and aggregated level. Studies have proven the relationship on individual level. Aggregated-level studies have found association between alcohol consumption in liters per capita and suicide rates in Nordic countries, Eastern Europe, Canada and US. The strength of this association is non-significant in central and southern Europe. However, a limited number of studies directly related to the scoping question exist.

### Population/Intervention(s)/Comparator/Outcome(s) (PICO)

Population: total population in the country

Interventions: alcohol restrictions, changes in alcohol policy (restriction are different by countries)

Comparisons: periods before, during and after changes in alcohol policy

Outcomes: reduction in suicidal behaviours

#### Search strategy

PubMed and Scopus databases were searched. Keywords used were "suicide", "alcohol policy" and "alcohol restrictions". All selected titles were screened in order to identify a subset of relevant papers. Another level of selection was performed by screening the abstracts of the papers. Reference lists of the relevant papers were also examined.

#### **Inclusion and exclusion criteria**

Inclusion criteria: all studies analysing the impacts of changes in alcohol policy in relation to suicide.

# Narrative description of the studies (including a study-by-study table)

| Author        | Title                     | Reference         | Study Design | Description of the study    | Results                                      |
|---------------|---------------------------|-------------------|--------------|-----------------------------|--|
| Mann JJ et al | Suicide prevention        | Journal of the    | Systematic   | The aim of this review was  | The authors only identified 2 studies that   |
| (2005).       | strategies. A systematic  | American          | review       | to examine evidence on      | demonstrated restrictions access to alcohol  |
|               | review.                   | Medical           |              | the effectiveness of        | which coincided with decreases in overall    |
|               |                           | Association,      |              | specific suicide            | suicide rates (in the Soviet Union and       |
|               |                           | 294:2064-74.      |              | interventions, including    | Iceland).                                    |
|               |                           |                   |              | those which restricted      |  |
|               |                           |                   |              | access to alcohol.          |  |
| Wasserman D,  | Male suicides and alcohol | Acta Psychiatrica | Ecological   | The paper analyses          | On 1 June 1985, Gorbachev introduced a       |
| Varnik A,     | consumption in the        | Scandinavaca,     | study        | correlation between         | major anti-alcohol campaign by law in the    |
| Eklund G      | former USSR.              | 89:306-13.        |              | alcohol consumption in      | USSR (known as <i>Perestroika</i> –          |
| (1994).       |                           |                   |              | liters per capita and       | restructuring). It included increasing the   |
|               |                           |                   |              | suicide, alcohol poisoning, | prices of alcoholic beverages, decreasing    |
|               |                           |                   |              | violent and undetermined    | alcohol production and the number of         |
|               |                           |                   |              | death rates in males in     | retail outlets for alcohol. Alcohol was only |
|               |                           |                   |              | former Soviet Union (in 15  | sold in exchange for coupons at fixed times  |
|               |                           |                   |              | former Soviet Republics)    | and the quantity of alcohol sold was         |
|               |                           |                   |              | during 1984-1990            | limited. Alcohol consumption was strongly    |
|               |                           |                   |              | (including Perestroika –    | correlated with male suicide rates from      |
|               |                           |                   |              | 1985-88).                   | 1984 to 1990. In Republics with high         |
|               |                           |                   |              |                             | alcohol consumption (Slavic and Baltic),     |
|               |                           |                   |              |                             | suicide rates were also higher. In the       |
|               |                           |                   |              |                             | Caucasian Republics, low alcohol             |
|               |                           |                   |              |                             | consumption was correlated with low          |
|               |                           |                   |              |                             | suicide rates. At least for the peak year of |
|               |                           |                   |              |                             | 1984, alcohol seems to explain 50% of male   |
|               |                           |                   |              |                             | suicides in most of the republics. Alcohol   |

|                           |   |                                    |                          |   | consumption also had considerable explanatory value for violent death. The authors conclude that a restrictive alcohol |
|---------------------------|---|------------------------------------|--------------------------|---|--|
|                           |   |                                    |                          |   | policy might present an opportunity to reduce suicide and other violent deaths.  |
| Wasserman D,<br>Varnik A, | Female suicides and alcohol consumption | Acta Psychiatrica<br>Scandinavaca, | Ecological study         | The aim of the paper was to analyse the association | Alcohol consumption was correlated with suicide rates for females from 1984 to   |
| Eklund G                  | during <i>Perestroika</i> in the        | 98(Suppl.394):26-                  | Study                    | between reduced alcohol                             | 1990. Compared to males, alcohol seems to  |
| (1998).                   | former USSR.                            | 33.                                |                          | consumption and decreased suicide                   | have a lower explanatory value for female suicides and violent deaths. The   |
|                           |   |                                    |                          | mortality in females in the former Soviet Union (8  | attributable fraction of alcohol for female suicides in the whole USSR was 27%,  |
|                           |   |                                    |                          | former Soviet Republics) from 1984 to 1990          | compared to 50% of male suicides.  |
|                           |   |                                    |                          | (including <i>Perestroika</i> – 1985-88).           |  |
| Nemtsov A                 | Suicides and alcohol                    | Drug and Alcohol                   | Ecological               | This paper analysed                                 | Suicides are strongly correlated with  |
| (2003).                   | consumption in Russia,<br>1965-1999.    | Dependence,<br>71:161-8.           | study<br>(including case | alcohol consumption and suicide rates in Russia in  | alcohol consumption in Russia. Alcohol consumption was strongly correlated with  |
|                           |   |                                    | series)                  | the past decades (1965-1999), including the anti-   | BAC-positive suicide numbers in eight regions in Russia. BAC-positive suicide  |
|                           |   |                                    |                          | alcohol campaign during  Perestroika. In eight      | numbers decreased during the anti-alcohol campaign. However, there were no   |
|                           |   |                                    |                          | regions, the blood alcohol                          | changes in sober (BAC-negative) suicides.  |
|                           |   |                                    |                          | levels of those who                                 | The author concluded that alcohol  |
|                           |   |                                    |                          | suicided (BAC positive or                           | consumption plays an important role in   |
|                           |   |                                    |                          | negative) was analysed.                             | suicide rates, especially for males.   |
| Värnik A et al            | Do alcohol restrictions                 | Addiction,                         | Case series              | The study analysed blood                            | In the analysis, suicide victims were divided  |
| (2007).                   | reduce suicide mortality?               | 102:251-6.                         |                          | alcohol concentration among suicide victims at      | by their blood alcohol concentration (BAC) using information from medical autopsies.                                   |

| Pridemore<br>WA, Snowden<br>AJ (2009). | Reduction in suicide<br>mortality following a new<br>national alcohol policy in<br>Slovenia: An interrupted<br>time-series analysis. | American Journal<br>of Public Health,<br>99:915-20. | Ecological<br>study | the time of death, by gender, before, during and after the major antialcohol campaign (Perestroika) in Estonia.  The aim of the paper was to assess the impact of the new national alcohol policy in Slovenia on suicide mortality using interrupted time-series techniques. | For both genders, BAC-positive suicide numbers decreased during the campaign (1986-88) compared to the previous period (1981-84). The largest changes were observed in BAC 2.5‰. There were no changes in BAC-negative suicide numbers. Suicide numbers started to rise after the end of campaign (1989-92). The authors concluded that despite the decrease in BAC-positive suicides, it is not possible to say if the decrease in suicide rates was due to the decrease in alcohol use as such.  In 2003, Slovenia changed its alcohol policy by establishing a minimum age of 18 years for the drinking and purchasing of alcoholic beverages. It also limited where and when alcoholic beverages could be purchased. The analyses of the effect of this new alcohol policy showed an immediate and permanent reduction in male suicide mortality in Slovenia. There was no effect on female suicides. The authors indicated the major potential of alcohol policy in reducing alcohol-related harm. |
|--|--|---|---------------------|--|---|
| Sloan FA,                              | Effects of prices, civil and   | Journal of Studies                                  | Ecological          | The paper analysed the   | Alcohol prices, civil and criminal junctions  |
| Reilly BA,<br>Schenzler C<br>(1994).   | criminal sanctions, and law enforcement on alcohol-related mortality.  | on Alcohol,<br>55:454-65.                           | study               | effects of various public policies on mortality rates by state and year in the USA for the years 1982-1988.  | and law enforcement were tested in relation to the alcohol related deaths. The price of alcoholic beverages was significantly associated with suicides. Increases in the monetary price of alcoholic beverages would reduce suicides and  |

|          |                            |                   |             |                           | deaths from the diseases in which alcohol is a contributing factor. The authors concluded that reductions in alcohol-related mortality may be achieved by implementing a mix of public policies. |
|----------|----------------------------|-------------------|-------------|---------------------------|--|
| Skog OJ  | Alcohol and suicide in     | Addiction,        | Case series | The aim of the study was  | During WWI, the blockade caused a  |
| (1993).  | Denmark 1911-1924 –        | 88:1189-93.       |             | to analyse alcohol        | substantial shortage of many commodities   |
|          | experience from a          |                   |             | consumption and suicide   | and the taxation of alcoholic beverages  |
|          | 'natural experiment'.      |                   |             | numbers (alcohol abusers  | increased dramatically in Denmark. In the  |
|          |                            |                   |             | and non-abusers) in       | analysis, suicide victims were divided by  |
|          |                            |                   |             | Denmark from 1911 to      | their drinking status (abuser or not)  |
|          |                            |                   |             | 1924. It included the     | according to the coroners report. A  |
|          |                            |                   |             | 'natural experiment' type | decrease in suicides was clear among   |
|          |                            |                   |             | of situation.             | alcohol abusers. However, there were no  |
|          |                            |                   |             |                           | clear changes in the numbers of non-   |
|          |                            |                   |             |                           | abuser suicides. Alcohol consumption was   |
|          |                            |                   |             |                           | strongly correlated with the suicide   |
|          |                            |                   |             |                           | numbers of alcohol abusers. The author   |
|          |                            |                   |             |                           | concluded that the Danish experience   |
|          |                            |                   |             |                           | confirms that the effect alcohol   |
|          |                            |                   |             |                           | consumption has on suicide rates,  |
|          |                            |                   |             |                           | especially among alcohol abusers.  |
| Lester D | Effect of changing alcohol | Psychological     | Ecological  | This paper aimed to       | In 1989 Iceland permitted the sale of strong   |
| (1999).  | laws in Iceland on suicide | Reports, 84:1158. | study       | explore the effect of     | beer which was associated with a decrease  |
|          | rates.                     |                   |             | changes in Iceland's      | in the consumption of spirits and an   |
|          |                            |                   |             | alcohol laws on suicide   | increase in the consumption of beer. After   |
|          |                            |                   |             | rates.                    | the legalization of strong beer, the total   |
|          |                            |                   |             |                           | suicide rate declined from 15.08 per   |
|          |                            |                   |             |                           | 100,000 per year in the period 1984-1988,  |
|          |                            |                   |             |                           | to 11.98 in 1990-1994. This decrease was   |
|          |                            |                   |             |                           | significant only for females.  |

| Andreasson S  | Estimates of harm          | Addiction,    | Ecological | This paper aimed to         | Since joining the EU, several changes have   |
|---------------|----------------------------|---------------|------------|-----------------------------|--|
| et al (2006). | associated with changes    | 101:1096-105. | study      | compare the actual          | taken place in Sweden: production,           |
|               | in Swedish alcohol policy: |               |            | developments of alcohol-    | wholesale, import and export monopolies      |
|               | results from past and      |               |            | related harm in Sweden      | were eliminated in 1995. An increase in      |
|               | present estimates.         |               |            | with estimates calculated   | alcohol consumption was estimated.           |
|               |                            |               |            | before the changes in       | Predicted alcohol-related harm was based     |
|               |                            |               |            | alcohol policy in 1995. It  | on time-trends 1950-1995 and calculated      |
|               |                            |               |            | also estimated the          | using estimates of alcohol sales and alcohol |
|               |                            |               |            | possible effects of reduced | consumption. Predicted alcohol-related       |
|               |                            |               |            | alcohol prices on           | harm was compared with real alcohol-         |
|               |                            |               |            | consumption and alcohol-    | related harm. The actual levels of harms     |
|               |                            |               |            | related harm in the future. | from assaults and accidents were relatively  |
|               |                            |               |            |                             | similar with the predictions. However,       |
|               |                            |               |            |                             | instead of the expected increase, suicides   |
|               |                            |               |            |                             | and homicides showed a decreasing trend.     |
|               |                            |               |            |                             | A possible future tax cut of 40% on spirits  |
|               |                            |               |            |                             | and 15% on wine was estimated to increase    |
|               |                            |               |            |                             | alcohol consumption by 0.35 litres per       |
|               |                            |               |            |                             | capita. This would produce considerable      |
|               |                            |               |            |                             | negative effects, with large economic        |
|               |                            |               |            |                             | consequences for the Swedish economy.        |

## **Methodological limitations**

Rather limited empirical attention has been paid on changes in alcohol policy and its impact on suicides. The main methodological limitation is that most of the studies are ecological in their nature. The main problem of ecological studies is ecological fallacy: being based on aggregated statistics, no comments can be made about changes at the individual level. Three case series exist: one divides suicide victims by their drinking habits (abusers or not) as per coroners' reports (Denmark 1911-24), and two others by blood alcohol concentration at the time of suicide from medical autopsies (Russia and Estonia in relation to *Perestroika*). Most of the studies were not able to adjust for possible confounding factors. An important limitation is also that the different countries are hardly comparable due to the differences in the level of restrictions in alcohol policies. There is absence of systematic reviews on this specific issue.

#### <u>Directness</u> (in terms of population, outcome, intervention and comparator)

A limited number of studies exist on the reduction of alcohol and its effects on suicide. There are no studies which measure the effect of the reduction of alcohol on other suicidal behaviours. However, the interventions vary in different countries.

#### **Narrative conclusion**

There is evidence in the literature that alcohol restrictions (reducing access to alcohol) are effective in decreasing suicide numbers/rates on an aggregated level, especially for males. However, a recent study from Sweden showed that a more liberal alcohol policy and an increase in alcohol consumption did not correspond to an increase the number of suicides. There is evidence that the impact of alcohol on suicidal behaviours differs depending on the country. However, different countries also have different alcohol policies and restrictions, which does not allow for valid comparison. Future research is needed in different cultural contexts.

#### **References**

Andreasson S et al (2006). Estimates of harm associated with changes in Swedish alcohol policy: results from past and present estimates. *Addiction,* 101:1096-105.

Lester D (1999). Effect of changing alcohol laws in Iceland on suicide rates. *Psychological Reports*, 84:1158.

Mann JJ et al (2005). Suicide prevention strategies. A systematic review. Journal of the American Medical Association, 294:2064-74.

Nemtsov A (2003). Suicides and alcohol consumption in Russia, 1965-1999. Drug and Alcohol Dependence, 71:161-8.

Pridemore WA, Snowden AJ (2009). Reduction in suicide mortality following a new national alcohol policy in Slovenia: An interrupted time-series analysis. *American Journal of Public Health,* 99:915-20.

Skog OJ (1993). Alcohol and suicide in Denmark 1911-1924 – experience from a 'natural experiment'. Addiction, 88:1189-93.

Sloan FA, Reilly BA, Schenzler C (1994). Effects of prices, civil and criminal sanctions, and law enforcement on alcohol-related mortality. *Journal of Studies on Alcohol*, 55:454-65.

Värnik A et al (2007). Do alcohol restrictions reduce suicide mortality? Addiction, 102:251-6.

Wasserman D, Varnik A, Eklund G (1994). Male suicides and alcohol consumption in the former USSR. Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavaca, 89:306-13.

Wasserman D, Varnik A, Eklund G (1998). Female suicides and alcohol consumption during *Perestroika* in the former USSR. *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavaca*, 98(Suppl.394):26-33.

### From evidence to recommendation

| Factor   | Explanation   |
|--|---|
| Narrative summary of the evidence base                                   | Limited epidemiological evidence suggests that alcohol restrictions (reducing access to alcohol) are effective in decreasing suicide numbers/rates on an aggregated level, especially for males. However, alcohol restrictions vary in different countries, which make valid comparison difficult.  |
| Summary of the quality of evidence                                       | The quality of evidence is moderate as it is based on ecological studies and three case series.   |
| Balance of benefits versus harms   | The benefits of restricting access to alcohol have been confirmed by a reduction in alcohol consumption and suicide deaths. Furthermore, many studies suggested that such restrictions might lead to a reduction in all alcohol-related deaths, such as accidents, homicide, alcohol cirrhosis, alcohol poisoning, etc.  No harm has been reported as a result of implementing the intervention strategies described. |
| Values and preferences including any variability and human rights issues | According to different countries and cultures, the prevalence of alcohol use varies.  |
| Costs and resource use and any   | Implementation of alcohol restrictions is a complicated political issue and is related to country's   |

| other relevant feasibility issues | taxes. Alcohol companies often try to influence the process. Strong public opposition in relation |
|-----------------------------------|---|
|                                   | to restricting access to alcohol in different countries also needs to be considered.              |

## Recommendation(s)

At the population level, policies to reduce harmful use of alcohol should be developed as a component of a comprehensive suicide prevention strategy, particularly within populations with high prevalence of alcohol use.

Strength of recommendation: STRONG

#### **Update of the literature search – June 2012**

In June 2012 the literature search for this scoping question was updated. The following systematic review was found to be relevant without changing the recommendation:

Crawford MJ, Csipke E, Brown A, Reid S, Nilsen K, Redhead J, Touquet R. The effect of referral for brief intervention for alcohol misuse on repetition of deliberate self-harm: an exploratory randomized controlled trial. Psychological Medicine (2010), 40, 1821–1828. doi:10.1017/S0033291709991899