

WHO Global Code of Practice on the International Recruitment of Health Personnel

National Reporting Instrument (2024)

Background

Adopted in 2010 at the 63rd World Health Assembly (WHA Res 63.16), the WHO Global Code of Practice on the International Recruitment of Health Personnel ("the Code") seeks to strengthen the understanding and ethical management of international health personnel recruitment through improved data, information, and international cooperation.

Article 7 of the Code encourages WHO Member States to exchange information on the international recruitment and migration of health personnel. The WHO Director General is mandated to report to the World Health Assembly every 3 years.

WHO Member States completed the 4th round of national reporting in May2022. The WHO Director General reported progress on implementation to the 75th World Health Assembly in May 2022 (A75/14). The report on the fourth round highlighted the need to assess implications of health personnel emigration in the context of additional vulnerabilities brought about by the COVID-19 pandemic. For this purpose, the Expert Advisory Group on the relevance and effectiveness of the Code (A 73/9) was reconvened. Following the recommendations of the Expert Advisory Group, the Secretariat has published the WHO health workforce support and safeguards list 2023.

The National Reporting Instrument (NRI) is a country-based, self-assessment tool for information exchange and Code monitoring. The NRI enables WHO to collect and share current evidence and information on the international recruitment and migration of health personnel. The findings from the 5th round of national reporting will be presented to the Executive Board (EB156) in January 2025 in preparation for the 78th World Health Assembly.

The deadline for submitting reports is 31 August 2024.

Article 9 of the Code mandates the WHO Director General to periodically report to the World Health Assembly on the review of the Code's effectiveness in achieving its stated objectives and suggestions for its improvement. In 2024 a Member-State led expert advisory group will be convened for the third review of the Code. The report of the review will be presented to the 78th World Health Assembly.

For any queries or clarifications on filling in the online questionnaire please contact us at WHOGlobalCode@who.int.

Disclaimer: The data and information collected through the National Reporting Instrument will be made publicly available via the NRI database (https://www.who.int/teams/health-workforce/migration/practice/reports-database) following the proceedings of the 78th World Health Assembly. The quantitative data will be used to inform the National Health Workforce Accounts data portal (http://www.apps.who.int/nhwaportal/).

What is the WHO Global Code of Practice?

The <u>WHO Global Code of Practice on the International Recruitment of Health Personnel</u> ("the Code"), adopted by the 63rd World Health Assembly in 2010, is a voluntary instrument that articulates the ethical principles on international recruitment and migration of health workers, in a way that strengthens the health systems of developing countries.

Objective	 Establish ethical principles and practices for international recruitment of health personnel. Serve as reference for the legal/institutional framework for international health personnel recruitment. Provide guidance for bilateral agreements and other international legal instruments. Advance cooperation with a particular focus on developing countries.
Nature and Scope	The Code is voluntary and global in scope.
Guiding Principles	 International migration of health personnel can contribute to strengthening health systems and safeguarding health personnel rights, if recruitment is properly managed and negative effects are mitigated. International health personnel recruitment should be conducted in accordance with the principles of transparency, fairness and health system sustainability in developing countries. Member States should consider the right to health of source countries' populations and individual rights of health personnel. The Code does not limit the freedom of health personnel, in accordance with applicable laws, to migrate to countries that wish to admit and employ them. Developed countries should provide technical and financial assistance for health systems strengthening. Member States should facilitate circular migration to the benefit of both source and destination countries.
Responsibilities, rights and recruitment practices	 Stakeholders should ensure fair recruitment and equal treatment practices of migrant health workers. Recruiters and employers should not seek to recruit health workers with existing domestic contractual obligations.
Health workforce development and health systems sustainability	 Active recruitment from countries facing critical shortage of health workers should be discouraged. Member States should use the Code as a guide when entering into bilateral, regional, and multilateral arrangements to promote international cooperation and coordination. All countries should strive to meet the health service needs through domestic human resources.
Data gathering and research	 Member States should strengthen their human resources for health information systems (HRHIS), including health personnel migration, and use the data to inform health workforce policies and plans.
Information exchange	 Member States should designate a national authority for information exchange on the Code and migration.
Code implementation	 Member States are encouraged to publicize, implement, and incorporate the Code into applicable laws and policies, in collaboration with stakeholders. Member States should promote Code principles among private recruitment agencies, assess the magnitude of active recruitment from countries facing health workforce vulnerabilities, and promote good practices among recruitment agencies.
Monitoring and institutional arrangements	 Member States should report on the application of the Code and associated challenges. The WHO Director-General should periodically report to the World Health Assembly on Code implementation. The World Health Assembly should periodically review the Code's relevance and effectiveness in achieving its stated objectives and update it as required.
Partnerships, technical collaboration and financial support	 International entities, financial and development institutions, and other relevant organizations are encouraged to provide technical and financial support for health system strengthening and health workforce development in developing countries, countries with economies in transition, those that are facing critical health workforce shortages and/or have limited capacity to implement the Code.

Contact Details

Name of Member State:
Name of designated national authority:
Title of designated national authority:
Institution of the designated national authority:
Email:
Telephone number:

National Reporting instrument 2024

The questions marked * are mandatory. The system will not allow submission until all mandatory questions are answered.

Contemporary issues on health personnel migration and mobility

1.1	In the past 3 years,	has the issue	of international	l recruitment of	f health pe	rsonnel been a	a concern fo	r your
	country?							

0	Yes, and it is increasing in intensity	Please describe the issue and any measures taken to
0	Yes, and it is decreasing in intensity	address it
0	Yes, and there has been no change in the	
	intensity	
0	No, this is not a problem in my country	

1.2 <u>In the past 3 years</u>, has the issue of international reliance on health personnel (international recruitment of health personnel to meet domestic needs) been a concern for your country?

0	Yes, and it is increasing in intensity	Please describe the issue and any measures taken to
0	Yes, and it is decreasing in intensity	address it
0	Yes, and there has been no change in the	
	intensity	
0	No, this is not a problem in my country	

Health personnel education, employment and health system sustainability

- 2. Is your country taking measures to educate, employ and retain a health and care workforce that is appropriate for the specific conditions of your country, including areas of greatest need? (*)
 - o Yes
 - o No

If no, please proceed to 3.1

If yes, please check all items that apply from the list below (*):

2.1 Measures taken to ensure the sustainability¹ of the health and care workforce

Measure	Yes	Please describe
Forecasting future health and care workforce requirements to inform planning		
Aligning domestic health and care workforce education with health system needs		

¹ Health workforce sustainability reflects a dynamic national health labour market where health workforce supply best meets current demands and health needs, and where future health needs are anticipated, adaptively met and viably resourced without threatening the performance of health systems in other countries (ref: *Working for Health and Growth, Report of the High-Level Commission on Health Employment and Economic Growth*, WHO, 2016, available from http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/10665/250047/1/9789241511308-eng.pdf?ua=1).

Improving quality of education and health personnel in alignment with service delivery needs		
Creating employment opportunities aligned with population health needs		
Managing international recruitment of health personnel		
Improving management of health personnel		
Specific provisions on health personnel regulation and recruitment during emergencies		
Others		Mandatory if yes
Measures taken to address the geographical mal-dis kers ² (Check all that apply) 2.2.1 Education		
Measure	Yes	Please describe
Education institutions based in rural/underserved areas		
Student intake from rural/underserved areas and communities		
Scholarships and subsidies for education		
Relevant topics/curricula in education and/or professional development programmes		
(Re)orientation of education programmes towards primary health care		
Others		Mandatory if yes
2.2.2 Regulation		
Measure	Yes	Please describe
Scholarships and education subsidies with return of service agreements		
Mandatory service agreements with health personnel that are not related to scholarships or education subsidies		
Enhanced scope of practice of existing health personnel		
Task sharing between different professions		
Provisions for pathways to enter new or specialised practice after rural service		
Others		Mandatory if yes
2.2.3 Incentives		
Measure	Yes	Please describe

 $^{^2}$ WHO guideline on health workforce development, attraction, recruitment and retention in rural and remote areas provides recommendations to address the factors that influence rural health workforce shortages and inequities in their distribution.

	Additional fina	ncial reimbursement		
	Education oppo	ortunities		
	Opportunities i	for career advancement or owth		
	Professional re	cognition		
	Social recogniti	on		
		r pathways to permanent or citizenship for international el		
	Others			Mandatory if yes
	2.2.4 Suppor Measure	t .	Yes	Please describe
		e working conditions		riease describe
	Decent and saf	e living conditions		
	Distance learni	ng/e-learning opportunities		
	Others			Mandatory if yes
foreign-trai		and/or laws that guides intern nnel in your country? (*)	ational recru	itment, migration and integration of
		If you at least one you is many	latam.	
	aw/policy 1	If yes, at least one row is mand	latory	
	aw/policy 2			
	aw/ policy 3			
3.2 Are there a personnel base	• •	or provision for international tel	ehealth servi	ces in your country through health
0	No			

3.3 Has your country established a database or compilation of laws and regulations related to international health personnel recruitment and migration and, as appropriate, information related to their implementation?

\circ	Ves

Web-link	Web-site
Other documentation	Upload document

o No

4 Recognizing the role of other government entities, does the Ministry of Health have mechanisms (e.g. policies, process, unit) to monitor and coordinate across sectors on issues related to the international recruitment and migration of health personnel? (*)

0	Yes
	Please describe
	Mandatory if yes

o No

5. Please describe the steps taken by your country to implement the following <u>Code</u> recommendations. Check all items that apply from the list below (*):

5.1	Measures have been taken or are being considered to introduce changes to laws or policies on health personnel consistent with the recommendations of the Code.	Mandatory if yes
5.2	Actions have been taken to communicate and share information across sectors on the international recruitment and migration of health personnel, as well as to publicize the Code, among relevant ministries, departments and agencies, nationally and/or subnationally.	Mandatory if yes
5.3	Measures have been taken to consult stakeholders in decision-making processes and/or involve them in activities related to the international recruitment of health personnel.	Mandatory if yes
5.4	Records are maintained on all private recruitment agencies for health personnel authorized by competent authorities to operate within their jurisdiction.	Mandatory if yes
5.5	Good practices, as called for by the Code, are encouraged and promoted among private recruitment agencies. Skip to 6 if not checked; if checked, respond to 5.5a-5.5d	
5.5a	Promotion of the Code among private recruitment agencies.	Mandatory if yes
5.5b	Domestic legislation or policy requiring ethical practice of private recruitment agencies, as consistent with the principles and articles of the Code.	Mandatory if yes
5.5c	Public or private certification of ethical practice for private recruitment agencies.	Mandatory if yes
5.5d	Others	Mandatory if yes

5.6	None of the above	

Government-to-Government agreements on migration or mobility of health personnel

- 6. Has your country or sub-national government entered into any bilateral, multilateral, or regional agreements and/or arrangements with respect to the international recruitment and/or mobility of health personnel? (*)
- o Yes
- o No

If no, please proceed to 7.

If yes, please answer the question related to the agreement(s) below (*)

6.1 Please use the table below to describe each of the active bilateral, regional or multilateral agreements or arrangements:

	6.1 Please u	se the tab	ne below to c	escribe each of	the active bila	iterai, reg	·		nts or arrangeme		r	
a. Title of Agreement*	b. Type of Agreement*	c. Countries involved*	d. Coverage	e. Main focus of agreement (check all that apply) *	f. Categories of Health Personnel (check all that apply) *	g. Validity period * (start year- end year)	h. Signatory of the your country*	agreement from	agre	atory of the ement from the ner country (ies) *	j. Content of agreeme	nt *
	o Bilateral o Multilateral o Regional		O National O Sub- national Please specify if sub-national:	 Education and training Health cooperation of circular migration Philanthrop y or technical support Qualification Recruitmen t of health personnel Trade in services Other: 	O Doctors Nurses Dentists Pharmacist S O Other (include details as necessary)		Ministry of Foreign Affairs Ministry of Health Ministry of Education Ministry of Labour Ministry of Immigration Nor Home Affairs Other:	If Ministry of Health is not a signatory, did the Ministry of Health participate in the development of the agreement? O Yes O No	Ministry of Foreign Affairs Ministry of Health Ministry of Education Ministry of Trade Ministry of Labour Ministry of Immigration or Home Affairs Other:	If Ministry of Health is not a signatory, did the Ministry of Health participate in the development of the agreement? No Don't know	j.i. Does the agreement include elements to benefit the health system of your country and the partner country(ies)? Yes, has elements to benefit the health system of my country and partner country(ies) Please explain: Yes, has elements to benefit the health system of my country only Please explain: Yes, has elements to benefit the health system of my country only Please explain: Yes, has elements to benefit the health system of partner country(ies) only Please explain: No, does not contain elements to benefit health system of either country	j.ii. Does the agreement include elements on health worker rights and welfare? O Yes Please explain: O No

6.2 Please use the table below to describe the implementation of each of the active bilateral, regional or multilateral agreements or arrangements

a. Title of Agreement	b. Has the agreement been implemented? * O Yes O No O Partially implemented If no, proceed to next agreement or next question	c. If agreement has been partially or completely implemented Start year of implementation:	d. How many health personnel have left or entered your country through this agreement since its implementation? * Category of personnel: Number of personnel:	If you answered yes in table 6.1 column j.i: e. Please explain if and how has the health system of your country benefitted from the agreement. *	If you answered yes in table 6.1 column j.i: f. Please describe if and how the health system of other country(ies) has benefitted from the agreement. *	If you answered yes in table 6.1 column j.ii: g. Please explain if and how the provisions on health workers rights and welfare were implemented. *	h. Please provide any other relevant information on the agreement (e.g., context, positive elements, gaps and lessons learnt).	i. Full text of the agreement and associated documents (implementation plan, progress report, implementation report, evaluation report, etc.) Upload document(s)	If any document uploaded j. Do you agree to make this available in the WHO repository on bilateral agreements that will be publicly available? * O Yes O No
--------------------------	---	---	--	--	---	--	--	---	--

Add 10 rows

Responsibilities, rights and recruitment practices

7. If your country employs/hosts international health personnel to work in the health and care sectors, which legal safeguards and/or other mechanisms are in place for migrant health personnel and to ensure that enjoy the same legal rights and responsibilities as the domestically trained health workforce?

Please check all items that apply from the list below (*):

Measures	Yes	Please describe
Migrant health personnel are recruited using mechanisms that allow them to assess the benefits and risk associated with employment positions and to make timely and informed decisions on the employment.		
Migrant health personnel are hired, promoted and remunerated based on objective criteria such as levels of qualification, years of experience and degrees of professional responsibility on the same basis as the domestically trained health workforce.		
Migrant health personnel enjoy the same opportunities as the domestically trained health workforce to strengthen their professional education, qualifications and career progression.		
Institutional arrangements are in place to ensure safe migration/ mobility and integration of migrant health personnel.		
Measures have been taken to promote circular migration of international health personnel		Mandatory if yes
Other measures (including legal and administrative) for fair recruitment and employment practices of foreign-trained and/or immigrant health personnel (please provide details)		Mandatory if yes
No measures in place		
Not applicable – does not host/employ foreign health personnel		

8. If health personnel from your country are working abroad in the health and care sectors, please provide information on measures that have been taken or are planned in your country to ensure their fair recruitment and employment; safe migration; return; and diaspora utilization in your country, as well as difficulties encountered.

Please check all items that apply from the list below (*):

Measures	Yes	Please describe
Arrangements for fair recruitment		Mandatory if yes

Arrangements for decent employment contracts and working conditions in destination countries	Mandatory if yes
Arrangements for safe mobility	
	Mandatory if yes
Arrangements for return and reintegration to the health labour market in your country	Mandatory if yes
Arrangements for diaspora engagement to support your country health system	Mandatory if yes
Other	Mandatory if yes
No measures in place	
Not applicable – health personnel from my country are not working abroad	

International migration and mobility pathways for health personnel

9.1 If your country hosts international health personnel to work in the health and care sector, how do they come to your country? (check all that apply)

	Direct (individual) application for education, employment, trade, immigration or entry in country	Government to government agreements that allow health personnel mobility	Private recruitment agencies or employer facilitated recruitment	Private education/ immigration consultancies facilitated mobility	Other pathways (please specify) (written comment)	Which pathway is used the most? Please include quantitative data if available. (written comment)
Doctors					•	
Nurses						
Midwives						
Dentists						
Pharmacists						
Other occupations (please specify)						

9.2 If health personnel from your country work/study abroad, how do they leave your country? (check all that apply)

Direct	Government	Private	Private	Other	Which
(individual)	to	recruitment	education/	pathways	pathway is

	application for education, employment, trade, immigration, or entry in the destination country	government agreements that allow health personnel mobility	agencies or employer facilitated recruitment	immigration consultancies facilitated mobility	(please specify) (written comment)	used the most? Please include quantitative data if available. (written comment)
Doctors						
Nurses						
Midwives						
Dentists						
Pharmacists						
Other occupations (please						
specify)						

Data on international health personnel recruitment & migration

foreign-trained health personnel? (*)

Improving the availability and international comparability of data is essential to understanding and addressing the global dynamic of health worker migration. Please consult with your NHWA focal point, if available, to ensure that data reported below is consistent with NHWA reporting³.

10 Does your country have any mechanism(s) or entity(ies) to maintain statistical records of foreign-born and

(For details on your country's NHWA focal point, please refer to the electronic version of the NRI or contact <u>WHOGlobalCode@who.int</u>)

0	Yes
0	No
If	no, please proceed to 11.
	If yes,
	10.1 Where are the records maintained? (check all that apply)
	☐ Employment records or work permits
	☐ Ministry of health personnel database
	Registry of health personnel authorized to practice
	□ Other
	(Others: please specify)

10.2 Does the record include gender-disaggregated data on the foreign-born and/or foreign-trained health personnel?

³ The National Health Workforce Accounts (NHWA) can be defined as a system by which countries progressively improve the availability, quality, and use of health workforce data through monitoring of a set of indicators to support achievement of universal health coverage, the Sustainable Development Goals and other health objectives. Since its launch in 2017, the NHWA has fostered a harmonized approach for annual and timely collection of health workforce information and defined core indicators in support of strategic workforce planning and global monitoring. The NHWA Handbook contains a standardized set of health workforce indicators and can be accessed at https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789240081291

Yes
Nο

Inflow and outflow of health personnel

- 11. Do you have a mechanism to monitor the inflow and outflow of health personnel to/from your country? (check all that apply)
- o Inflow
- Outflow
- o No

If no, please proceed to 12.

If yes for inflow:

- o Fill in the table below
- o Share data in the NHWA platform (indicator 1-09) through NHWA focal point

11.1 How many foreign-trained or foreign-born health personnel were newly active (temporarily and/or permanently) in your country in the past three years (inflow)?

	Doctors	Nurses	Midwives	Dentists	Pharmacists	Remarks
Data Source (e.g.						
Regulatory authority,						
immigration records,						
work permits, etc.)						
Please ensure data						
source consistency for						
each category of						
personnel for the						
three years						
2021						
2022						
2023						

If yes for outflow:

- o Fill in the table below
- O Share data in the NHWA platform (indicator 1-10) through NHWA focal point

11.2 How many domestically trained health personnel left your country in the past years for temporary or permanent migration (outflow)?

	Doctors	Nurses	Midwives	Dentists	Pharmacists	Remarks
Data Source (e.g.						
letters of good						
standing, emigration						
records, government						

to government agreements etc.)			
Please ensure data source consistency for each category of personnel for the three years			
2021			
2022			
2023			

11.3 If you have any document with information on health worker inflows and outflows for your country, please upload.

	_	•
Upload document		

Stock of health personnel

12.1 Consolidated stock on health personnel, disaggregated by country of training and birth

For the latest year available, consistent with the National Health Workforce Accounts (NHWA) Indicators 1-07 and 1-08, please provide information on the total stock of health personnel in your country (preferably the active workforce), disaggregated by the place of training (foreign-trained) and the place of birth (foreign-born).

Please provide data on the stock of active health personnel in your country by one of the following ways (*):

- o Fill in the table below
- o Share data in the NHWA platform through NHWA focal point
- o Data not available

If data shared in the NHWA platform or data not available, please proceed to the next question.

	Total	Place of training	Place of training		Place o	f birth	*Data Source (e.g. HRH information systems; professional register; covid-19 vaccination records; others)	*Year of data (Latest year available)	Does the data represent active stock? (Yes/ No)	Remarks	
		Domestic Trained	Foreign	trained		National Born	Foreign Born				
			total	national born	foreign born						
Medical Doctors (generalist + specialists)											
Nurses											
Midwives) 					 				
Dentists											
Pharmacists											

their distribution by place of training and place of birth, please upload				
Upload document				

12.1.1 If you have any document with information on stock of active health personnel for your country,

12.2 Please provide data on the top **10** countries of training for foreign-trained health personnel in your country. This information can be provided by one of the following two options:

- o Fill in the table below
- o Share data in the NHWA platform through NHWA focal point

	Doctors	Nurses	Midwives	Dentists	Pharmacists
Total foreign-					
trained					
personnel					
1. Country of					
training					
Number of					
personnel					
2. Country of					
training					
Number of					
personnel					
10. Country of					
training					
Number of					
personnel					
*Source (e.g.,					
professional					
register, census					
data, national					
survey, other)					
*Year of data					
(Please provide					
the data of the					
latest year					
available) Remarks					
Remarks					

12.2.1 If you have any document with information on the distribution of foreign-trained health personnel for your country by their country of training, please upload.

	Uploa	oad document					
Tech	nical a	and financial support					
13.	health workfo Code (e	workforce support and safe rce development, health sys	I or financial assistance to any source countries or countries in the WHO guards list 2023, or other low- and middle-income countries on health tem strengthening, or for implementing other recommendations of the rmation and research on health workforce for translation to policies and				
0	Yes						
0	No						
		lease proceed to 14	annation below (*) /aback all that and a				
	If yes, p	•	ormation below (*) (check all that apply): orkforce development (planning, education, employment, retention) (if andatory)				
		Country supported	Type of support (please specify)				
			elements of health system strengthening (service delivery; health in financing; medical products and technology; and health leadership and least one row mandatory)				
		Country supported	Type of support (please specify)				
		13.3 Other areas of support	: (if checked at least one row mandatory)				
		Country supported:					
		Support Area:					
		Type of support:					
		Country supported:					
		Support Area:					
		Type of support:					
		Country supported:					

		Support Area:	
		Type of support:	
		L	
14	stakeh streng	olders (e.g., development partno thening, or for implementing	I or financial assistance from any WHO Member State or other ers, other agencies) for health workforce development, health system other recommendations of the Code (e.g., strengthening data, orkforce for translation to policies and planning, etc.)? (*)
0	Yes		
0	No		
		lease proceed to 15.	
	If yes,	please provide additional inforn	nation below (*) (check all that apply):
		14.1 Support for health workf checked at least one row mand	orce development (planning, education, employment, retention) (if datory)
		Supporting country/entity	Type of support (please specify)
	u		nents for health system strengthening (service delivery; health nancing; medical products and technology; and health leadership and st one row mandatory)
		Supporting country/entity	Type of support (please specify)
		14.3 Other areas of sunnort: (i	f checked at least one row mandatory)
	_	Supporting country/entity:	reflected at least one fow mandatory,
		Support Area:	
		Type of support:	
		Supporting country/entity:	
		Support Area:	
		Type of support:	
		Supporting country/entity:	
		Support Area:	
		Type of support:	

15. Please list in priority order, the three main constraints to the ethical management of international migration in your country and propose possible solutions:

Main constraints	Possible solutions/recommendations
15.1 a	15.1b
15.2 a	15.2b
15.3 a	15.3b

16. V	Vhat support do	you require to	strengthen in	nplementation of	of the Code	? (*)
-------	-----------------	----------------	---------------	------------------	-------------	-------

Area of support	Yes	Description
Support to strengthen data and information on health personnel		
Support for policy dialogue and development		
Support for the development of bilateral/multi-lateral agreements		
Others		Mandatory if checked
No support required		

17. Considering that <u>the Code</u> is a dynamic document that should be updated as required, please provide reflections from your country on the past 14 years since the resolution on the Code.

Please comment on if/how the Code has been useful to your country. (*)	Please describe
Do any articles of the Code need to be updated?	YesNo Please describe
Does the process of reporting on Code implementation and the review of the Code relevance and effectiveness need to be updated?	o Yes o No Please describe
Please comment on the WHO health workforce support and safeguards list (e.g. if your country is included in the list, how has that affected you; if your country is reliant on international health personnel, how has the list affected you; if your country is not in the list, how has it affected you)	Please describe

18. Submit any other complementary comments or material you may wish to provide regarding the international recruitment and migration of health personnel, as related to implementation of the Code.

Please describe OR Upload (Maximum file size 10 MB)