

Management Response

Evaluation Title	Country Office Evaluation: Kyrgyzstan
Commissioning Unit	WHO Evaluation Office
Link to the evaluation	https://www.who.int/publications/m/item/country-office-evaluation-kyrgyzstan-report
Evaluation Plan	WHO Organization-wide evaluation workplan for 2018-2019
Unit Responsible for providing the management response	WHO Country Office, Kyrgyzstan
<p>Overall Management Response: Accepted.</p> <p>The Country Office Evaluation of WHO Country Office for Kyrgyzstan was an opportunity to review WHO presence in the country, work already completed in past several years, as well as to investigate future plans of WHO and main stakeholders in building a better, healthier future for people in Kyrgyzstan. All recommendations presented by this Country Office Evaluation were very welcome and accepted in order to further strengthen activities towards achieving Universal Health Coverage by 2030. Despite Covid-19 pandemic and emergency response in the country, most of the recommendations have already been initiated and are already in progress. Report of the Country Office Evaluation of WHO Country Office for Kyrgyzstan became a valuable document in the country not just for WHO but also for Ministry of Health as well as development partners.</p>	
Management Response Status	<p><i>In progress</i></p> <p>Strategic partnerships have been further scaled up, and new ones established, in areas of development partners, academic research, engagement with local stakeholders, Parliament, media, extended network of collaborators on the NCD control, partnership with stakeholders in area of public health. This is an ongoing process, as the Country Office monitors and assesses new opportunities for collaboration for the GPW13 and European Programme of Work (EPW) implementation. An immediate result of extended and strengthened partnership is a well-coordinated, efficient and effective Covid19 response. WHO is greatly valued for its ongoing support to the response, and is recognized by the general public- Covid19 related messages reached up to 6.5 million people in 2020.</p>
Date	18 February 2021

Recommendations and Action Plan

Recommendation 1: Support to Government for the 2030 National Health Strategy implementation The WHO Country Office should capitalise on the significant momentum it has achieved in enhancing its strategic partnerships at country level to better contribute towards improving the health status in Kyrgyzstan. It is recommended that the WHO Country Office use its convening power around health to: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> I. consider how to facilitate better support to the Ministry of Health in its implementation of the 2030 National Health Strategy through strategic engagement with other ministries in pursuit of an intersectoral approach to health (e.g. Ministry of Agriculture on the zoonotic sources of antimicrobial resistance, Ministry of Environment on the environmental sources of noncommunicable diseases, and so on); II. engage strategically with other health system actors in sectors where partnership has not been as well developed, including non-State actors; and III. enhance partnership with other United Nations agencies wherever such intersectoral work would enhance efficiency and effectiveness in pursuit of shared objectives in support of the Government. 				
Management response	Accepted <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Further to assistance provided to the Ministry of Health in developing the 2030 National Health Strategy, WHO Country Office has continued to provide support in the implementation of the strategy in close cooperation with Minister of Health, Deputy Ministers of Health, National Counterpart, etc. - In coordination with the Ministry of Health, support from WHO Country Office has been provided to a number of health agencies. - In order to enhance efficiency and effectiveness of the support provided to the Government of Kyrgyzstan, WHO Country Office has been working with all other UN agencies present in the country within the United Nations Country Team as well as directly with United Nations Resident Coordinator. 			
Status	<i>In progress</i>			
Key actions	Responsible	Timeline	Status	Comments
WHO Kyrgyzstan facilitate inter-sectoral working groups on prevention of NCD, reduction tobacco usage and healthy cities	WR	By the end of 2020	<i>Implemented</i>	In close collaboration with the Ministry of Health and with involvement of municipality of Bishkek city, ministries of finance, social protection, agriculture, education, sports and environment protection inter-agency working groups have regular activities towards achieving the status of healthier population.
Facilitate improvement policy dialogue and collaboration between Mandatory Health Insurance Fund, MoH, primary health care facilities, academia and national health centres	WR	By the end of 2021	<i>In progress</i>	High Level Policy Dialogue on SDG Global Action Plan conducted in November 2019 with involvement of all SDG GAP signatory agencies, WHO HQ, EURO and CO staff. The event was well attended by all social sector national counterparts and clear targets and accelerators defined. As a result of collaboration WHO prepared and published Towards Healthier Kyrgyz Republic Report in 2020 https://www.euro.who.int/en/countries/kyrgyzstan/publications/towards-a-healthier-kyrgyz-republic.-progress-report-2020-on-health-and-sustainable-development-2020 . However regular policy dialogues in different health aspects should be generated by WHO on inter-sectoral approach/ Close monitoring of implementations of actions should be established.

Close collaboration with the Office of UN Resident Coordinator and other UN Agencies maintained	WR and technical units	By the end of 2020	<i>Implemented</i>	In 2019-20 collaboration with UN Agencies was intensified around review and actions through UNDAF and SDG 2030. Due to COVID-19 related challenges UN Resident Coordinator activated Health Cluster under the leadership of WR and inter-sectoral COVID-19 Contingency and Response plans developed and implemented
---	------------------------	--------------------	--------------------	---

Recommendation 2: Strategic focus

The Regional Office for Europe and the Head of the WHO Country Office should elaborate a longer-term strategic planning instrument – extending over a period of multiple future Biennial Collaborative Agreements, and over the period of the Thirteenth General Programme of Work and beyond – that ensures a good strategic fit with the unmet needs of Kyrgyzstan, the directions set by its Government in the 2030 National Health Strategy, the Thirteenth General Programme of Work, the Sustainable Development Goals and WHO's comparative advantage. Relying on WHO's recognized comparative advantages, this strategy should:

- I. ensure an explicit focus on long-term strategic issues for Kyrgyzstan, including: primary health care, with its emphasis on prevention; the continued burden of communicable diseases, while still addressing the growing burden of noncommunicable diseases; and the role of gender, human rights and equity as social determinants of health;
- II. articulate a theory of change to better frame the pathway for change, including a clear priority-setting process and targets for both the expected outcome and output levels, and clarify the expected contribution from all levels of the Organization in a measurable manner;
- III. further develop its role in bringing impartial research to bear on policy discussions (including by conducting or commissioning a cost-effectiveness analysis to demonstrate the benefits of investing in health, exploring the respective merits of voluntary versus mandatory approaches to health insurance funding), building on its successes in this area to date;
- IV. likewise increase its role in promoting health through awareness-raising initiatives aimed at behavioural change, similarly building on its successes in this area to date;
- V. redouble its focus on strengthening digitization and institutionalizing digital health and, within its support role to Government, in advocating for the enactment, implementation, monitoring and enforcement of the draft law on essential medicines price regulation;
- VI. set up a monitoring framework to measure WHO's progress in supporting Government toward its targets; and
- VII. establish a regular informal forum to bring key stakeholders around the table to discuss WHO's work and progress against planned activities and allow exchange of knowledge and best practice.

Management response	<p>Accepted</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A Country Cooperation Strategy (CCS) as WHO's medium-term strategic vision to guide the Organization's work in and with a country responding to that country's specific priorities and institutional resources needed to achieve its national health policies, strategies and plans, as well as the actions needed to achieve its national targets under the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in the WHO European Region has been used to countries without country offices, as per the agreement with member States at Regional Committee 62. However, there have been discussions, related to implementation of the Thirteenth General Programme of Work, on whether to have CCSs with all countries as the strategic basis for the bottom-up planning process, consisting of the identification of a focused and coherent set of priorities responding to country needs. Up to date only few countries in the Region developed the CCS.
----------------------------	--

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - WHO Country Office has already been involved in supporting development of Kyrgyzstan's 2030 National Health Strategy as one of the steps for strategic basis for the bottom-up planning process and contribution to the health dimension of the UNDAF, harmonizing WHO's cooperation with Kyrgyzstan in order to achieve the SDGs by 2030. - WHO Representative in Kyrgyzstan has been engaged in ensuring that WHO work at country level responds to national health priorities, including national SDG targets, as well as supporting national health emergency risk assessments, national capacities in emergency risk and disaster risk management, and readiness for emergency response. 			
Status	<i>In progress</i>			
Key actions	Responsible	Timeline	Status	Comments
Develop and facilitate a Joint Statement of Intends by Development Partners	WR	End of 2020	<i>Implemented</i>	WHO Kyrgyzstan facilitated high level of engagement of 25 development partners to sign the joint statement of intends on support of National Health Strategy 2019-2030. The statement clearly underlines collaborative and transparent working environment and realistic targets towards Universal Health Coverage. WHO will continue facilitation of high level policy dialogue in supporting primary health care development, digital health, health promotion and reduction of risk factors of NCD. WHO will also support development of institutional capacity in response to immediate health needs of population of Kyrgyzstan.
Joint Annual Review (JAR) of Health Sector Plans an implementation of National Health Strategy 2019-2030	WR and EURO technical units	April 2021	<i>Postponed for June 2021</i>	WHO is leading the preparatory process for JAR 2021 with national counterparts and development partners. Despite political changes in the country and Covid-19 related restrictions all interested parties have agreed to conduct the review at the end of April 2021. The agenda includes inter-sectoral collaboration towards integration of public health services into primary health care, improved quality and access to basic health services at PHC level and integration of multiple data basis in one unique electrotonic data base towards eHealth.
Facilitation of Voluntary National Report 2020	WR and WCO staff	August 2020	<i>Implemented</i>	WHO along with other UN Agencies facilitated the process of drafting, consulting and submission to UNGA the Voluntary National Report (VNR) https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/26459VNR_2020_Kyrgyzstan_Report_English.pdf . The report covers national commitments towards achieving the SDG 2030 through Global Action Plan implementation and monitoring national SDG indicators. Resource mobilization and institutional capacity building expected to support the VNR by all development partners. WHO will further facilitate national institutions in achieving their SDG targets with health impact.
Development and implementation of Covid-19 Contingency and Response Plans	WR and WCO staff	June 2022	<i>In progress</i>	Due to global Covid19 pandemic WHO in Kyrgyzstan has led development partners in developing and implementation of Covid19 Contingency Plan and later, Covid19 Consolidated Response Plan on supporting national health system to timely respond to health needs of population and reduce mortality and disease burden. WHO is closely working on implementation of the plans with USAID, World Bank, ADB, GIZ, DEVCO, DFID, GAVI and newly established COVAX facility on and other initiatives.
Participation in the UNDAF Mid-Term Review	WR and WCO staff	April 2021	<i>In progress</i>	WHO staff is facilitating three main outcomes of UNDAF Kyrgyzstan. In 2020 due to Covid-19 many activities were postponed or reprofiled for Covid19 related needs in the country. However joint work-plan was carefully reviewed and adjusted to ongoing circumstances in Kyrgyzstan. WR is a Co-Chair of Social Development and Resilient Communities outcome

				group and leading UNICEF, UNFPA and UNDP in joint health related activities. WR is also a Co-Chair of Gender Mainstreaming thematic group and leading UN Agencies on prevention of injuries and mental disorders due to domestic violence. Despite Covid19 series of online activities will be undertaken for prevention of domestic violence in families and communities with WHO participation.
Develop and incorporate a Theory of Change in further planning process of current and next biennia activities and outputs aligned with GPW 13 and European programme of Work (EPW)	WR and WCO staff	September 2021	<i>Not initiated</i>	Due to complex emergency situation in the country, including COVID-19 pandemic and cross-border unrest this activity has not yet started. During planning of BCA 2022-23 process the issue will be discussed and developed in details.

Recommendation 3: Continued leadership and visibility following the end of the transformation process

- I. In order to sustain the momentum achieved through the WHO Country Office transformation process, the WHO Country Office should ensure adequate follow-up on key initiatives is maintained so that its gains are sustainable, and staff remain motivated to contribute to the significant work ahead in supporting implementation of the 2030 National Health Strategy.
- II. In order to sustain the momentum achieved through the *WHO transformation process*, the WHO Country Office should liaise with the Regional Director and his team to ensure that the support of the Regional Office for Europe continues to maximally enable the work of the WHO Country Office in its support to implementation of the 2030 National Health Strategy (and, by extension, attainment of the health-related Sustainable Development Goals). Specific areas it should address include: maximizing internal communication and coordination within the Regional Office to ensure efficiency, coherence and complementarity of support; achieving an optimal balance between WHO Country Office accountability and delegation of authority to the WHO Country Office; and timeliness and efficiency of business processes.

Management response	<i>Accepted</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <i>WHO Country Office's strong presence and developed capacity at country level ensures that our support is relevant and effective. WHO Regional Office provides guidance and further support for adequate follow-up on key initiatives. At the same time, WHO's global network also enables other countries to learn and benefit from the lessons learnt in Kyrgyzstan.</i> - <i>Regional Director for Europe provides great support to Kyrgyzstan and other countries of Central Asian sub-region, as well as to WHO Country Office. Regular meetings are held with Ministers of Health on topics important for improvement of health in countries, guided by European Programme of Work 2020-2025 'United Action for Better Health in Europe'</i> 			
Status	<i>In progress</i>			
Key actions	Responsible	Timeline	Status	Comments

Bimonthly Meetings of Health Sector Development Partners Coordination Council (DPCC)	WR Health Policy Advisor	Ongoing	<i>In progress</i>	WHO along with the WB is a Co-Chair of DPCC Health Sector. Within the Health DPCC group a core group so called "Joint Health Financiers" have regular formal and informal meeting to discuss hot and specific health governance topics, such as health financing, quality of primary health care and other issues. Regular bimonthly meetings are conducted for broader audience on different topics.
Long term partnerships/ collaborations for GPW13 and EPW priorities established	WR	June 2021	<i>In progress</i>	WR will facilitate discussions with relevant stakeholders to establish long term collaboration/partnerships to address Kyrgyzstan's long-term priorities. This will be an ongoing process throughout the biennium and beyond. Collaborative partnerships have been further scaled up, and new ones established, in areas of academic research (SRCMNH); engagement with local stakeholders, partners and authorities (AMR, immunization, NCD strategy development); Ministry of Emergency Readiness and collaboration with neighbouring countries are new partners for WHO; media on tobacco control; broaden network of collaborators on NCD control, and supported the establishment of PHC governance team sherd between MOH and Mandatory Health Insurance Fund; professional associations and academia.
WCO will support National Counterpart to help identify country delegates at various meetings organized by WHO, participation of Kyrgyzstan in Governing Bodies of WHO such as WHA and Regional Committee meetings	WR	Annually, with regular updates in May and September	<i>In progress</i>	To support enhancement of focal points list assigned to relevant areas of collaboration, smoothing country nominations, and create a pull of experts and civil society champions to lead implementation of country's long-term strategic plan. It is an ongoing process. Very much depends on MOH management, including who they want to collaborate with from national institutions. Exchange with the current National Counterpart is efficient and productive, she also consults with WCO on best fit nominees to attend WHO-related meetings, while considering long term institutional and public health gain. Participation of Kyrgyzstan in Governing Bodies of WHO will enhance role of member-states in implementation of WHA resolutions and enable country's representation and participation on main WHO events and activities.
Facilitate Socio-economic Response Framework (SERF) to Covid19 impact	WCO staff	2022	<i>In progress</i>	WHO facilitated Pillar 1 "Health First" of the Socio-Economic response Framework development and implementation. All UN Agencies united their efforts under the leadership of WHO in three main areas 1) Support surge capacity of national health system to respond Covid19; 2) Facilitate continuation of basic and essential health services; 3) Support most vulnerable groups of population so that No one left behind.
Facilitate leadership and visibility of WHO in Kyrgyzstan as an outcome of transformation process	WR and WCO staff	By the end of 2021	<i>In progress</i>	WR with support from Regional Director and all EURO divisions will continue strengthening capacity of country office staff, developing communication materials and policy briefs for all stakeholders as well as continuously holding policy dialogue in the health systems development. WHO will also complete second edition of Kyrgyzstan Health in Transition publication and present to RC 71 Meeting.

Recommendation 4: Mapping of staff capacity to strategic priorities

The WHO Country Office staffing and skills mix should be assessed in the light of the priorities, addressing gaps for relevant areas and providing capacity building opportunities to existing staff in order to be better prepared and respond more effectively to the emerging strategic priorities of the country.

Management response	<i>Accepted</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - WHO Country Office in coordination with the WHO Regional Office is following up closely on any gaps for relevant areas and is providing its response to country needs. - Learning and Development in EURO plays an integral role in helping our workforce successfully implement the European Programme of Work (EPW). WHO Regional Office is developing EURO Learning Strategy and data collected from the workforce through various mechanisms will feed into the strategy. - Regional Director for Europe is a great supporter of country office staff who are implementing the EPW in countries which is a priority for WHO Regional Office. Any opportunities for capacity building of staff is well taken. 			
Status	<i>In progress</i>			
Key actions	Responsible	Timeline	Status	Comments
Establishment and planning of process for mapping of staff capacity to strategic priorities of GPW 13 & EPW	WR/WCO With RD Office	2020	<i>Implemented</i>	To identify key positions at WHO Country Office in the HR Plan and prioritise the needs as per strategic priorities. To set participatory and strategic planning meetings with technical divisions. The planning process was participatory and successful.
Complete recruitment of International VPI Officer	WR	March 2020	<i>Implemented</i>	VPI Officer in WHO CO facilitates technical support for Kyrgyzstan and leads technical working group in immunization and COVAX initiative on Covid19 vaccine deployment plan. VPI Officer will contribute to Outcome 1 of GPW and Immunization Flagship of EPW
Complete recruitment and deployment of Health Policy Advisor	WR	March 2020	<i>Implemented</i>	Health Policy Advisor will contribute to Governance of health systems and enrich policy dialogue in health agenda. Series of publications have already been published https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/governance-for-strategic-purchasing-in-kyrgyzstan-s-health-financing-system
Complete upgrading NPO positions in Human resources for Health, Laboratory Services and Health Financing and UHC	WR	By the end of 2020	<i>Implemented</i>	In 2019 majority of NPO positions were temporary. WR in close collaboration with technical divisions revise, prioritised and completed upgrading the positions to fix-term posts through appropriate competency-based selection process
Upgrade three positions of Programme Assistants, G5 to fixed term posts	WR	By March 2021	<i>In progress</i>	Upgrading positions of programme assistants to fixed term through competency-based selection will facilitate improved quality and sustainable technical support throughout several biennia