

**Final Project Evaluation of FAO and WHO FAO/WHO PROJECT AND FUND FOR ENHANCED PARTICIPATION IN CODEX  
(CODEX TRUST FUND)**

Section No.	Recommendation	Management Response	Key Actions	Time Frame	Responsible Unit(s)	Status	Comments
1	Develop a Codex promotional and engagement strategy with the Codex Secretariat to advocate for national support for Codex programs. This aligns with the Codex Strategic Plan Objective 3 and will help to address the root cause of the factors that impact on the sustainability of developing country participation in Codex. An engagement strategy can consist of various methods. As an example, some respondents indicated that the 50th Anniversary Celebrations of Codex attracted Ministerial level participation from many countries that went a long way to promoting the relevance of Codex and the importance of country participation in Codex processes. There is also a need to raise the priority and profile of food safety within WHO and FAO itself. Conditions at national level are often a reflection of the international landscape and if food safety is not a priority item on WHO and FAO governance bodies it is hard to make a case for it at national level.	Accepted	In light of the Codex Communications Strategy tabled at the 38th session of the Codex Alimentarius Commission (CAC), rather than developing a separate promotional and engagement strategy, messaging that goes out under the implementation of the Codex Communications strategy will be "fine-tuned" with input from FAO/WHO to achieve the aim of securing policy and economic support for Codex activities among policy and decision-makers from key sectors and stakeholder groups.	2015-2019	FOS (for WHO) with FAO and Codex Alimentarius Commission Secretariat	Started	Messaging on CTF2 in Codex Communications Strategy being worked on for 39th CAC. In addition to working through Codex communications strategy, separate discrete communications and advocacy pieces to be drawn up for CTF2. CTF2 informational flyer finalized in November 2015. CTF fundraising flyer to be developed March 2016.
2	Redefine program objectives in light of evolving needs of eligible countries. A recurring theme throughout the findings of the evaluation is that the CTF was a 12-year program and that adjustments were made through-out the period based on ongoing assessments and monitoring. The changes however were limited by the original scope (project document) and were in some cases were slow to be implemented. There is an opportunity at this time, when WHO and FAO are developing a successor program, to ensure that there is a built-in iterative planning process that will allow for timely adjustments to project scope and objectives to accommodate changes in the operating environment, as well as eligible country needs and priorities as they evolve over in the future.	Accepted	Successor initiative (CTF2) has an iterative planning process that allows for timely adjustments through its 12 year lifespan, and the founding document itself can be revisited to ensure that it retains full relevance for the needs of countries throughout the entire period of the successor initiative (2016-2027)	2016-2027	CTF2 Steering Committee consisting of FOS (for WHO) with FAO and Codex Alimentarius Commission Secretariat	Started	Iterative planning process written into founding Project Document of CTF2. First periodic review will take place in 3-4 years after start of CTF2 in January 2016.
3	Improve financial reporting. Year-by-year comparisons should be presented in order to permit comparisons. The costs of any Program Support Costs (overhead), in addition to Project Management and Administration costs, should be clearly indicated. WHO and FAO should make efforts to accurately collect and report on the level of in-kind contribution that is being expended on the CTF.	Accepted	Reporting on Codex Trust Fund is made to all Codex member countries (including CTF donor countries) through annual reports and progress reports tabled at the Executive Committee of the Codex Alimentarius Commission (CCEXEC) and the Commission (CAC). As of 2015, the Codex Trust Fund Annual Report now includes a financial reporting table that details out expenditures for each calendar year broken down into: staff and administrative costs; expenditure by project objectives; monitoring and evaluation costs. Programme support costs for each calendar year are clearly indicated. In-kind contributions from CTF donor countries have also been noted in the 2014 Annual Report. These practices will continue in the future.	2016-2027	Codex Trust Fund Secretariat (located in FOS)	Started in 2015 with new financial reporting in 2014 Annual Report	

4	<p>Improve the cost analysis of the CTF. There can be better definitions of costs (e.g., what costs are included in training workshops before a Codex meeting, what allowance is made for in-kind contributions) in order to be able to provide cost analysis of project activities. As an example, is a one-day training before a Regional Coordinating meeting cost effective, or is there greater value in a 2 or 3 day workshop? Does pooling DSA for workshops result in cost savings?</p>	Accepted	Discussions currently underway with budget and finance officers in both WHO and FAO to see how the WHO and FAO budget and finance systems can be used to provide cost analysis that can be used to monitor cost-effectiveness of different approaches to implementing activities without creating additional administrative work and/or having to create parallel systems outside the normally used budget and finance systems of the two organizations.	2016-2027	Codex Trust Fund Secretariat, FNM/ACT, & corresponding departments/units in FAO	Started	
5	<p>For effective participation, an approach that assesses both the individual delegate and country conditions needs to be in place. For individuals this may include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• First time, newer delegates have to be fully justified in application;</li> <li>• First time, newer delegates must complete online training course (tested);</li> <li>• First time, newer delegates be twinned with/mentored by more experienced members, subject matter experts, or third parties; and</li> <li>• First time, newer delegates should be assessed by mentor/partner at end of meeting and report submitted to country.</li> </ul> <p>For countries this may include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Change the application process: multi-year application available, based on engagement strategies demonstrating consistency and outlining proposed role of CTF support and flexible package of assistance;</li> <li>• For other countries unable to comply with requirements of multi-year funding, their support can be funded based on current application processes; and</li> <li>• Respect your own guidelines. Applications can be too late and not accepted. Applications can be refused for being incomplete or unsatisfactory.</li> </ul>	Partially accepted	As 2015 was the final year of CTF1, little could be done to implement this recommendation in the remaining implementation period of CTF1. Suggestions included in this recommendation that were taken on board in the development of the successor initiative include: moving to multi-year applications; flexible packages of assistance to meet the needs of a country or group of countries; engagement strategies with demonstrable outcomes; provision of information on how the proposed role of CTF2 may complement national support and/or other sources of support.	2015-2016	Codex Trust Fund Secretariat with the Consultative Group for the Codex Trust Fund (CTF1)	Completed	All relevant suggestions from this recommendation have been included in the design of the successor initiative and figure in the founding Project Document for CTF2.
6	<p>Undertake an analysis in regards to country needs regarding increasing availability of scientific evidence and develop a clear range of project activities that can be supported by an initiative such as CTF. There is consensus across the project's stakeholders that the provision of scientific data to the Codex process is critically important. There is however, a wide range of opinions on possible areas of intervention for CTF to support this objective. This wide range of opinions indicates that further needs assessment and identification should be conducted in order to better target project activities that are appropriate to CTF. The activities should be realistic given that historically the CTF has over 130 eligible countries and has expended \$640,000 over 10 years (from 2004 to 2013) on the overall objective.</p>	Partially accepted	FAO and WHO still see clear needs among member countries in terms of improving their scientific and technical input to Codex standards development - which can include provision of data, but is by no means limited to this. Some of these needs of countries for improving their capacity in this area may be addressed in countries/groups of countries through the CTF2 application process. FAO/WHO may decide that there is a need for further analysis at some point in the future.	2016-2027	FOS (for WHO) with FAO and Codex Alimentarius Commission Secretariat	Started (for provisions built into CTF2)	With regard to the second part of the recommendation to "develop a clear range of project activities that can be support by an initiative such as CTF", in the context of CTF2 a decision was taken by FAO/WHO to put the emphasis on increasing knowledge of science and risk assessment in standard-setting, and ensuring that countries and delegates are skilled in understanding the scientific advice provided by FAO/WHO and bringing scientific knowledge and data to the negotiation process. Any data collection activities supported will be part of a comprehensive and integrated process emanating from the national level through a country or group application, and will be tied to a specific data gap for standard-setting work in Codex.

7	Better align staffing to project scope. The structure and staffing of a CTF Secretariat will need to take into consideration project goals, objectives and activities to ensure the right balance of capacity and technical competency to meet project objectives, without an unsustainable, over-reliance on in-kind contributions of WHO and FAO staff.	Accepted	Support required to reinforce FAO and WHO technical contribution to CTF2 work through the CTF Secretariat written into the founding Project Document and budget. Staffing needs will be revisited as needed throughout the timespan of CTF2 to ensure that staffing continues to align with project scope.	2016-2027	FOS (for WHO) with FAO and Codex Alimentarius Commission Secretariat	Started with budgeting for additional professional staff in 2016, 2017 and 2018	Further progress on this recommendation dependent on receipt of increased and multi-year contributions from donors.
8	Develop strategies and plans to increase predictability of funding. In the future, if there are shifts of focus to effective participation, and a shift to more tailor-made capacity building approaches that intend to impact on institutional capacities, long-term activities and strategies need to be utilized which cannot be supported with current funding patterns. There is a need for longer-term, more predictable funding. The project has made some progress in this regard but more diverse sources of long-term funding are needed.	Accepted	WHO and FAO implementing actions to increase level of contributions to meet increased needs, obtain multi-year contributions to increase visibility of funding and widen the donor base. Priority actions include: reaching out to development and trade sectors; identifying and working with CTF2 "ambassador" countries; tailored approaches to individual donors; organization of fundraising events including "Call for Action" event (completed in Nov 2015), CTF2 1st Financing Dialogue (April 2016), CTF2 pledging meeting (June 2016).	Began in 2014 and will continue throughout lifespan of CTF2	FOS (for WHO) with internal resource mobilization units and departments (e.g. within cluster and with CRM) and with FAO and Codex Alimentarius Commission Secretariat	Discussions with donors began in 2014. Roll out of first actions to advocate with donors and increase funding and visibility began in Nov 2015.	"Call for Action" event in Nov 2015 to be followed up by a "Financing Dialogue" in April 2016 and a pledging meeting during the 39th CAC in June 2016.
9	Continue development of Monitoring and Evaluation frameworks. The CTF has made commendable progress in developing and utilizing an M+E framework. The framework should continue to evolve and any new results frameworks should also include baselines and targets, with objectives that are SMART (i.e., Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Relevant, and Time-bound).	Accepted	Based on the results framework appearing in the founding Project Document, a log-frame was developed that also appears in the Project Document and an M&E framework will be drafted in 2016.	Began in 2015. Will continue in 2016 with development of M&E framework and establishment of baselines. M&E will continue throughout the lifespan of CTF2 with periodic reviews planned every 3-4 years, an external mid term review halfway through the implementation period, and a final external project evaluation in 2026.	CTF Secretariat (located in FOS) with the CTF2 Steering Committee and external expertise in M&E	Started	Results framework and draft logframe developed and appear in founding Project Document. M&E framework currently being developed for internal discussion between Mar-June 2016 and for possible presentation to 39th CAC in June 2016.

10	Lessons learned and new best practices should be integrated more quickly and with more consistency into the regular project supported activities of the CTF, within the operational realities of the UN and Codex system.	Partially accepted	In CTF1 regular feedback was received from beneficiary countries and donor countries and this feedback was used to identify and implement action for improved management and/or implementation. For example, the CTF Secretariat was strengthened as a management response to feedback and a new Group 4 was created to further ensure the sustainability of participation in Codex of least developed countries and small island developing states as an operational response to the risk of these countries not being able to sustain their participation after graduation from the Codex Trust Fund. With CTF2, FAO and WHO are formalizing the mechanism for continuous dialogue with major stakeholders through the establishment of the CTF2 Advisory Group. Along with the continuous monitoring that will be undertaken using the M&E framework, the Advisory Group will constitute key mechanisms for integration of and action on learning and application of good practices.	2016-2027	FOS (for WHO) with FAO and Codex Alimentarius Commission Secretariat	Not started	
----	---	--------------------	---	-----------	--	-------------	--