World Health Organization

Report of the Third Meeting of the Review Panel on the Overall Programme Review of the Global Strategy and Plan of Action on Public Health, Innovation and Intellectual Property

ORGANIZATION AND PROCESS OF THE MEETING

The third and final meeting of the review panel took place at WHO Headquarters in Geneva on the 14-15th September 2017 as per the agenda set out in Annex 2. Of the 18 members of the review panel (listed in Annex 1), 16 were present on the first day, and 17 on the second. The member from India (Dr Soumya Swaminathan) participated on both days via telephone.

The main objectives of the meeting were to discuss timelines for completion of the report, including the writing of an executive summary to be presented to the Executive Board in January; to review of the Terms of Reference to ensure that the report reflects them; to discuss Chapter Five and agree on content; discuss the recommendations and agree on content; discuss of chapter 1 to 3 and agree on content.

SUMMARY OF PROCEEDINGS

1. The Co-Chairs welcomed the members and thanked them for their contributions to date.

2. The secretariat presented a review of progress since the second meeting which took place in Geneva on the 14th and 15th of June. Progress was reported to include:

- the production of draft chapters 2 and 3 by sub-group 2 (appointed during the first panel meeting), followed by a round of input from panel members and the secretariat, and subsequent redrafting;
- the production of an introduction and a new draft of chapter 1 by the secretariat in consultation with co-chair Prof Elias Mossialos;
- the production of chapter 5 by the secretariat in consultation with Prof Elias Mossialos based on a prioritization exercise undertaken at the second meeting.
- an informal interim meeting held at Chatham House in London in August, attended by 14 members of the panel who reviewed drafts of all chapters, accepted the draft of chapter 4, discussed pending issues with other chapters and discussed recommendations for the way forward and input for chapter 5.

3. The co-chairs set out the overall objectives of the third review panel meeting as being to discuss and, if possible, agree on the content of the report, including the recommendations.

There was a discussion of the deadlines that needed to be met in order to fulfil the requirement of the TOR, and for the report to be ready for the Executive Board in January 2018 and World Health Assembly in May 2018.

The Co-Chairs then set out the schedule for the next two days (as per Annex 2).

The panel asked for clarification regarding costing of the recommendations. It was explained that costing would be undertaken by the secretariat, but it was noted that it would be helpful

for the panel to discuss who would be responsible for implementation of the recommendations. It was noted that one of the challenges faced in implementing the GSPA-PHI was the fact that responsibility for implementation was assigned too broadly. It was also pointed out that an estimated budget for the secretariat undertaking the different tasks assigned to it needed to be drawn up.

4. The secretariat presented chapter five which sets out the lessons learned from the overall programme review, including the assessment of the GSPA-PHI Evaluation, and presents key considerations regarding the possible way forward.

Before addressing the content of chapter 5, there was some discussion regarding whether or not chapters 4 and 5 should be combined. It was pointed out that the TORs specifically called for an assessment of the evaluation which would be best answered by a standalone chapter.

Regarding the recommendations, there was a discussion of the priority-setting process (including the optimal scope for the GSPA-PHI, and prioritization). The argument was repeated that the GSPA-PHI was too broad to be implementable, and thus narrowing of scope/phased implementation was required.

The Chapter 5 text was reviewed and specific suggestions were made regarding substantive changes (particularly relating to the tone of comments regarding the process used in negotiating the text). It was then decided to put unresolved issues aside, and to focus on drawing up the recommendations.

After the coffee break, the panel initiated discussion of the recommendations, and used live editing to make changes.

The review panel then considered the post-2022 scenario, and discussed whether the TOR calls for discussion of goals/targets beyond that date. The secretariat said they would consult with the legal department.

Day two began with a discussion regarding tone, nomenclature and content. Key issues debated included:

- R&D investment in neglected diseases;
- Transparency on R&D costs
- Transparency on medicines prices
- Free Trade Agreements and TRIPS plus;
- incremental innovation and evergreening etc.

The argument was made that it was important to ensure that intellectual property and, more narrowly, patents were not the central focus of the report, but were seen as just one issue among many.

In the afternoon the panel considered the new draft chapter 5 that was generated based on the previous day's discussion. A number of emendations were made using live editing.

The Co-Chairs concluded the meeting, thanking the panel members for their contributions.

Annex 1. List of Members of the Review Panel on the Overall Programme Review of the Global Strategy and Plan of Action on Public Health, Innovation and Intellectual Property

Dr Chutima Akaleephan. Former Program Manager and Senior Researcher, International Health Policy Program, Ministry of Public Health, Thailand

Dr Salah Nasser Khalfan Al Muzahmi. Assistant DG of Planning and Studies, Ministry of Health, Oman

Dr Ibrahim A. Aljuffali. Executive Vice President for Drug Affairs, Food and Drug Authority, Saudi Arabia

Ms Christine Ardal, Senior Advisor, Institute of Public Health, Norway

Dr Shabir Banoo. Chief Technical Specialist, Pharmaceutical Policy and Programmes, Right to Care, South Africa

Dr Claudia Chamas. IP advisor to the director of the Centre for Technological Development in Health (CDTS), Oswaldo Cruz Foundation, Brazil

Prof Carlos Correa. Director of the Center for Interdisciplinary Studies on Industrial Property and Economics and of the Post-graduate Course on Intellectual Property at the Law Faculty, University of Buenos Aires, Argentina

Prof Jonathan Craig. Associate Dean and Chair, Research and Research Training Committee, Sydney School of Public Health, University of Sydney, Australia

Prof Yan Guo. Professor of School of Public Health, Vice President of Peking University Health Science Center, China

Dr Martha Gyansa-Lutterodt. Director of Pharmaceutical Services and Chief Pharmacist, Ghana

Dr Harimat Hendrawan. Deputy Director of Health Resources, Center of Health Resources and Services Research and Development, Ministry of Health, Republic of Indonesia

Mr Erik Iverson. Managing Director, Wisconsin Alumni Research Foundation (WARF), United States of America. (absent first day)

Dr Bita Mesgarpour. Director of National and International Affairs at National Institute for Medical Research Development (NIMAD), Islamic Republic of Iran

Dr Jaime C. Montoya. Executive Director, Department of Science and Technology, Council for Health Research and Development, Philippines

Prof Elias Mossialos. London School of Economics and Political Science and Imperial College London, United Kingdom

Prof Ibrahima Seck. Technical Adviser of Minister of Health, Senegal (absent both days)

Dr Soumya Swaminathan. Secretary to the Govt. of India, Department of Health Research, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare & Director General, ICMR, India (participated by telephone)

Prof Yazdan Yazdanpanah. Head of Infectious Disease department at Bichat Claude Bernard Hospital, head of an Inserm team on decision analysis in Infectious Diseases, and Professor of Medicine at Paris Diderot University, France.

Annex 2. A**genda**

14 September	**WHO Headquarters, Salle A**
8:30-9:00	Welcome coffee/tea
9:00-9:30	Opening Remarks Presentation of process so far and timelines Terms of Reference of the Review
9:30-10:30	Chapter 5: Review and agree on Recommendations GSPA-PHI: the way forward
10:30-11:00	Coffee/Tea
11:00 -12:30	Chapter 5: Review and agree on Recommendations GSPA-PHI: the way forward
12:30-14:00	Lunch break
14:00-15:30	Chapter 5: Review and agree on Recommendations GSPA-PHI: the way forward Mechanisms for implementation, identification of stakeholder, resources, Monitoring and Evaluation
15:30-16:00	Coffee/Tea
16:00-17:30	Chapter 5: Review and agree on Recommendations GSPA-PHI: the way forward Mechanisms for implementation, identification of stakeholder, resources, Monitoring and Evaluation
	Members are requested to kindly go through all chapters to be ready for endorsing the text.
15 September	**WHO Headquarters, Salle A**
8:30-9:00	Welcome coffee/tea
9:00-10:30	Go through pending issues and endorse text
10:30-11:00	Coffee/Tea
11:00-12:30	Go through pending issues and endorse text
12:30-13:30	Lunch break
13:30-15:30	Discuss other elements of the report (preface, executive summary, annexes)
15.30 -16.00	Wrapping up and closure of the meeting